HUMAN RIGHTS COUNCIL

34th Session of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review (UPR)

Stakeholders' Submission on:

The Human Rights Situation in ITALY

Submitted by:

Associazione Comunità Papa Giovanni XXIII (APG23)  
(NGO in Consultative Status with the ECOSOC)

International Office, via Ausa n.39- 47921 Rimini- Italy  
Tel: +39 0541 24765 - Email: international@apg23.org  
Website: www.apg23.org

Submitted in Geneva, March 2019
INTRODUCTION
Associazione Comunità Papa Giovanni XXIII (APG23) is a catholic international association founded in Italy by Fr. Oreste Benzi. Its activities in the world of poverty and marginalization brought to the direct sharing of the life with the poor. The Community is now established in 37 countries throughout the five continents.¹²

1. HUMAN RIGHTS AND PEACE
FOCUS ON: Recommendations³ n° 145.52 - 145.62 - 145.105
In the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and in the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action, peace is strongly interrelated with the respect for human rights. Peace is conceived as founded on the recognition and respect for the equal and inalienable rights of all and on the protection of human rights by the rule of law⁴, without which peace would be threatened.

In 2018, APG23, as a result of the commitment of its members and volunteers - together with the victims of conflicts and wars⁵, promoted a National⁶ and International⁷ Campaign for the establishment of the Ministry of Peace; on the basis of article 3 of the 2016 Declaration on the Right to Peace, which requires "adequate and sustainable measures to implement the present declaration", it encouraged every State to pay more attention to the theme of peace, suggesting them to establish a Ministry of Peace. (ANNEX IV)⁸.

Recommendation:
1) Establish a Ministry of Peace – as a practical, appropriate and sustainable measure - to implement the right to peace and to reinforce the institutional apparatus for peace, by creating structures and skills at the local and national levels.

2. RIGHTS OF THE CHILD
FOCUS ON: Recommendations n° 145.54 - 145.91 - 145.113 - 145.128 - 145.132
APG23 has been a member of the National Observatory for Childhood and Adolescence at the Council Presidency. APG23 collaborates with the CNSA (National Coordination Services Department) and is a member of the National Table for Fostering⁹; it is also an ordinary member of the National Forum of Family Associations¹⁰. APG23 is among the promoters of the “Giving a Future” Campaign¹¹, that makes urgent requests to the Italian southern and central regions for the protection of children's right to have a family, with proposals for re-launching foster care in southern Italy. APG23 participates in the campaign for awareness on fostering, adoption and general welcoming "Dönàiti" ("Give yourself") of the National Forum of Family Associations¹².
APG23 collaborated in the drafting of the project "Welcoming women with offspring"¹³ promoted by Caritas and Migrantes together with the prison chaplains¹⁴ ¹⁵; APG23 welcomes requests for the reception of minors who need to be hosted into families and family homes¹⁶, made by the social services, the courts for minors, and by individuals from all over the national territory. In 2017, APG23 welcomed in Italy 347 women with difficult motherhood of which 240 were pregnant, the remaining ones with dependent children in serious economic difficulties; 35% of women were Italians, 65% foreigners; 56% of them, after being offered help, chose to...

¹ See www.apg23.org
² Its commitment at the UN is the result of sharing the life with the poor and is the fruit of the international elaboration and synthesis of the action for the removal of the root causes which create injustice
⁴ As Mr. Kofi Annan stated, “respect for human rights is the best guarantee of peace and the establishment of a durable peace is a condition of the respect for human rights”
⁵ See commitment of Non-Violent Peace Corps www.operazionecolomba.it and of service https://www.odcpace.org/new/
⁸ As Kofi Annan stated, “the aim should be the creation of a sustainable national infrastructure for peace [emphasis added] that allows societies and their governments to resolve conflicts internally and with their own skills, institutions and resources” (UN General Assembly, 2006 p. 16).
⁹ Working table of National Associations / Family Networks born in 2010 see: http://www.tavolonazionaleafamiglie.it/
¹⁰ http://www.forumfamiglie.org/
¹¹ http://www.dirittoallafamiglia.it;
¹² http://www.forumfamiglie.org/donati/)
¹³ See: http://www.iseccapp.org/PreHous/docs/AccoglienzaDonneProle.pdf
¹⁴ This is a project aimed at making mothers in prison (with their children) serve their sentence not behind bars, but in the reception facilities of various associations (including the family houses of the apg23) spread throughout Italy.
¹⁵ This project responded to the need of 23 women with children (11 of whom came from Rebibbia Prison), four of whom were admitted to the CF of the apg23 community. To date, there are about 60 mothers with mostly Roma children and about ten pregnant mothers.
¹⁶ See: https://casafamiglia.apg23.org/. In 2017, the Association welcomed 583 children (64 immigrant children and 73 children with disabilities) and 737 children worldwide (210 in Europe, excluding Italy) into its family homes and foster families in Italy.

2
continue the pregnancy. Of all pregnant women, 24% were subjected to pressure and/or instigated to abort. In 61% of cases, the pressures came from the family environment and mainly from the partner.

2.1 National Plan for Children
On 10th August 2016, the Council of Ministers drafted the 4th “National Action Plan and Interventions for the protection of the rights and development of subjects in developmental age”\(^{17,18}\), after the go-ahead from the National Observatory for Children and Adolescence. The provision was adopted on 31st August 2016 by decree of the President of the Republic\(^ {18,19}\). Unfortunately, the re-launch of the Childhood Observatory has not yet been defined and it is not clear whether the new Government will adopt the indications expressed by the Plan.

Recommendations:
2) Restart the activities of the National Observatory for Children and Adolescence, clarifying its role and functions, making it an effective tool, not only a bureaucratic apparatus, with the establishing of defined days throughout the year.

2.2 National Guarantor and Regional Authorities for Children
APG23 has collaborated in the drafting of a document\(^ {20}\) prepared by the working group on mental health of adolescents, activated within the Council of associations and organizations, established and chaired by the Authority for Children and Adolescents.

Recommendation:
3) Provide that the National Guarantor and the Regional Children's Guarantors may make legal opposition/appeals to actions and measures that are harmful and/or inappropriate with respect to the promotion of children's rights.

2.3 Right of the child to a family
On 14\(^{\text{th}}\) December 2017 the Unified State Regions Conference approved the "Guidelines for the reception of residential services for minors"\(^ {21}\). According to the latest report published in November 2017 in the *Quaderno della ricerca sociale n. 40*\(^ {22}\), there were about 26 thousand children and adolescents in family custody or in residential services on 31\(^{\text{st}}\) December 2014. APG23 participated in the technical table that drafted the new Guidelines, chaired by the Ministry of Labour and Social Policies\(^ {23}\). However, these guidelines are not binding, and are not clearly stating that children under 6 must be inserted only in truly familiar structures\(^ {24}\). As already recommended in our submission for the 2\(^{nd}\) cycle of UPR Italy\(^ {25}\), a database for serious and very serious disabled children, institutionalization in psycho-pedagogical facilities or the permanence in hospitals and/or health facilities is lacking. There is still no full recognition of the role of Family Associations in the various phases of the assignment project\(^ {26}\); at national level, legislation that recognizes full dignity to the reception structures set up on the model of the natural family, such as the 'Complementary Multi-User Family Homes' managed by parental figures or couples permanently residing in them, is also necessary\(^ {27}\).

Recommendations:
17 \[\text{http://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/eli/id/2016/11/15/16A07780/sg}\]
18 \[\text{It is divided into four areas of intervention: lines of action to combat child and family poverty; socio-educational services for early childhood and quality of the school system; strategies and interventions for school and social integration; support for parenting, integrated system of services and care system.}\]
19 \[\text{The Plan defines the panorama of interventions that Italy intends to put in place in the next two years to implement the contents of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, signed in New York on 20th November 1989. This programmatic tool and direction, is constantly monitored with the aim of verifying the progress achieved and the impact of policies adopted in favour of children and young people.}\]
20 \[\text{http://www.guarantiefamiglia.org/sites/default/files/salute-mentale-adolescenti.pdf}\]
22 \[\text{Of these, 12,400 minors were admitted to residential services, a number that has remained substantially stable over the last decade, half of whom were between the ages of 15 and 17. One chapter is dedicated to the reception of unaccompanied foreign minors. Unfortunately, the Guidelines are not binding, as they are the exclusive property of the regions, but are entrusted to the territories for validation in terms of content and methodology.}\]
23 \[\text{See: http://www.minori.it/sites/default/files/ORS_40.pdf}\]
24 \[\text{The table was made up of representatives of the Ministry of Justice - Department for Juvenile Justice, the Conference of Regions and Autonomous Provinces, ANCI, with the full involvement of representatives of the world of associations working in the reception and with the participation of the offices of the Guarantor Authority for Children.}\]
26 \[\text{This type of response is to be favoured, differentiating it from educational communities and/or other forms of reception, which as a type and approach are closer to mini institutes. Unfortunately, the regional regulations have regulated the matter in a very different way, giving definitions and rules that differ from region to}\]
4) Fully implement national guidelines for family custody and for inclusion in residential services.
5) Establish in each Region a Working Table on minors outside the family consisting of public operators and private social workers that work in associations for the protection of minors.
6) Operate to definitively overcome the placement of children under 6 years of age in structures that are not really familiar, promoting specific projects for the reception in a family.

2.4 Prenatal life and motherhood

Reiterating the recommendations already indicated in our report for the 2nd UPR cycle, we frequently meet women driven to abortion in particular by the partner, by the parents or by the economic and working context (ANNEX III). Pregnant women do not find sufficient regulatory protection in facing this issue; moreover, there are no facilities able to give immediate reception to these women. In fact, to avoid pressures for abortion, the pregnant woman needs to get away in extremely short time (in our experience, within 48-72 hours from the first meeting) from the negative surrounding environment and remain in a reality of reception until the end of pressure.

Presidential Decree 285/90 (Article 7) provides that children dead before the 20th week of pregnancy may be buried only at the request of the parents while the burial of children dead later are guaranteed. The sensitivity towards these children is growing at the jurisprudential level: in recent years the European Court of Human Rights has recognized that a father has the right to know where his son was buried before he was born. Burial is also important at a psychological level: it is increasingly recognised that adequate attention to the remains of the dead child, facilitates the process of mourning. However, parents who request burial are often given a negative answer, alleging bureaucratic or practical obstacles. Furthermore, many couples complain that they have not received adequate information about this possibility. The burial of prenatal babies in many cases occurs in undignified ways.

Recommendations:
7) In alignment with CRPD, to set adequate procedures so that the prenatal diagnosis of disability is not a cause of recourse to abortion.
8) Define standardized procedures at national level aimed at removing the causes that induce women to abortion, as stated in art. 5 of law 194, providing adequate human and economic resources.
9) Prepare operational protocols for the detection of the phenomenon of induction, facilitation and coercion to abortion, aimed at the protection of women and children from possible violence as well as formulate protocols for the specific training of health personnel on this matter.
10) Establish temporary shelters for pregnant women who receive pressure to abort and penalties for those who exercise such pressures.
11) Guarantee the right to a proper burial of foetuses.

2.5 Roma Minors

APG23 supports and accompanies about 40 Roma families, in which 80 persons are adults and 120 are minors under the age of 15.

Access to citizenship for Roma children of second and third generations born and living in Italy - very often

region so as to appear contradictory.

28 See above note 27
29 In fact, even if abortion without the consent of the woman is penalized by Italian law (by the same Law 194/78), actually it is extremely rare that those who threaten or blackmail the woman for going to abort suffer some consequence for the difficult discipline of the phenomenon.
30 It is common that within a few months people who instigated abortion change their mind and come to accept the child.
31 The ECHR judgment of 12 June 2014, Marić v. Croatia (see Infra) relating to a case of elimination of the foetus born dead in a hospital. Cedu affirmed the violation of the right to respect for private and family life, enshrined in art. 8 Cedu, accepting the appeal of the father of the child who complained that he could not obtain any information about the place of burial of the body, even in the presence of an original consent of the parents to the autopsy and subsequent burial of the body by the hospital. The Court thus leads back to the conventional parameter of the right to know the place of burial.
32 In recent years several associations of parents have been born or have grown up to take care of those who have experienced pre- and perinatal bereavement, with whom we are in contact, and they also ask for more attention to the bodies of their children. We believe that the birth of these new realities is an indication of a greater sensitivity towards children that comes from below which must be responded to with greater attention and respect for the bodies of children.
33 We experience their negative reaction when they come to learn that the remains of their little ones have been disposed of along with the special waste. In recent years, our toll-free number has received calls from couples asking for support or complaining that their request had been rejected, or not having known of this possibility. Usually the parents who asked for the burial alone could not get it, but when they asked for it with our support, they got it. See also the testimonials available in http://www.apg23.org/downloads/files/La%20vita/Maternit%C3%A0%20Difficile/maternit %C3%A0%20difficile/BambiniNonNati_APG23.pdf and ANNEX III . In recent years several associations of parents have been born or have grown up to take care of those who have experienced pre- and perinatal bereavement, with whom we are in contact, and they also ask for more attention to the bodies of their children. We believe that the birth of these new realities is an indication of a greater sensitivity towards children that comes from below which must be responded to with greater attention and respect for the bodies of children.
34 They cannot have a gravestone with a name, and are placed in anonymous fields, not very dignified, marginalized, and sometimes do not have an individual space.
35 Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
stateless - is still far from being facilitated; indeed, the legislation in this regard has worsened significantly with the law 1 December 2018, n. 132\textsuperscript{36}, which has provoked a strong reaction of civil society that raised doubts on its constitutionality.

Recommendations:
12) As implementation of the National strategy, to promote the training of cultural mediators of ethnic Sinti and Roma for an active involvement and a better interaction of families in the school, with projects of "welcoming education" throughout the school year.
13) Promote orality as a form of communication in school curricula, enhancing narrative and collective history.
14) Implement linguistic laboratories, for the "maintenance" of the Roma language as an instrument for the enhancement of cultural identity.
15) Raise awareness and accompany families to increase the inclusion of children in educational services for children.
16) Facilitate with specific regulatory measures access to Italian citizenship of stateless minors in fact and born in Italy.

2.6 Minors in prison
The latest data from the Department of Prison Administration (DAP), updated to 31 August 2018, show that there are 52 Italian mothers with 62 children in the Italian prisons, almost equally spread between Italians (27 mothers with 33 children) and foreigners (25 with 29 children)\textsuperscript{37}. To 31 May 2018, children under three years of age in prison- in areas called "nesting sections" - were 8 (with 7 mothers)\textsuperscript{38}. In the five Institutes with Attenuated Custody for detained Mothers (ICAM), where they can stay up to six years, there were - again as of 31 May 2018 - another 18 (with 15 mothers). It is important to reaffirm the exceptional nature of the precautionary custody and reinforce in case of necessity the prediction of home arrest or at specific protected family houses. The prediction of the accommodation in ICAM - which is good to remember are still penitentiary structures and sometimes not even fully adequate -, appears in the legislation\textsuperscript{39}only as a makeshift instance. This question is periodically at the centre of the attention of the politicians, social actors and of the legislator but no progresses are made on this matter.

Recommendations:
17) Give effective and full implementation of the law 62 of 2011, which provides that detained mothers, and their children, find shelter in protected family homes.

3. JUSTICE AND DETENTION
FOCUS ON: Recommendations n° 145.100 up to 145.104, 145.129
Since its foundation, APG23 has welcomed thousands of prisoners and former prisoners; with the project CEC\textsuperscript{40} (ANNEX I), it has actively participated in the institutional table of the " General states of criminal execution" (2015-2016), a long path of reflection and proposal\textsuperscript{41} regarding the exercise of the law of delegation of reform n. 103 of 2017\textsuperscript{42}. However, with the change of legislature, no proxies were exercised for the revision of the methods and conditions for access to alternative measures, with a view to their wider application and the delegation for the revision of the system of foreclosures to the access to penitentiary benefits from the proactive perspective emerged by the General States\textsuperscript{43}. In addition to these, we reiterate the recommendations of our previous report.\textsuperscript{44}

---

\textsuperscript{36} Available at: http://www.normativa.it/uri-res/N2Ls?urn:nir:stato:decreto.legee-2018-10-04:113!vig=

\textsuperscript{37} This number is decreasing compared to the previous survey of March 2018, when 58 mothers with 70 children were kept in Italian prisons. The "record" is due to the Rebibbia prison, where there are 13 women with 16 children.

\textsuperscript{38} Here children can stay with their mothers until they are 3 years old.

\textsuperscript{39} Law no. 62 of 21 April 2011 entitled "Amendments to the Code of Criminal Procedure and Law no. 354 of 26 July 1975, and other provisions for the protection of the relationship between mothers and minor children. Available at: http://www.gazzettarufficiale.it/eli/id/2011/05/05/011G0105/sg

\textsuperscript{40} See Annex II

\textsuperscript{41} Prison operators, magistrates, lawyers, teachers, experts, representatives of culture and civil associations were involved in 18 thematic working groups, each of which dealt with one aspect and compared points of view. See all documents in: https://www.giustizia.it/giustizia.it/img_2_19?page=sesssionId=Xs=2Y'=b5FpGIOSRz/DataKd=2017070417G00116/sg

\textsuperscript{42} With the aim of starting this process to arrive at a new model of criminal execution and a better physiognomy of the prison, more dignified for those who work there and for those who are restricted and with a view to a far-reaching reform of the prison system provided for by the delegated law no. 103 of 2017. Available at: http://www.gazzettarufficiale.it/eli/id/2017/07/04/17G00116/sg

\textsuperscript{43} Moreover, the relative powers have not been exercised: restorative justice and re-offending mediation have not been exercised, as qualifying moments of the social recovery process both in the intramural context and in the execution of alternative measures (letter f), for the affirmation of the right to affectivity (letter n); to the protection of the relationship between prisoners and minor children (letter s); to the protection of freedom of worship (letter v).

\textsuperscript{44} See above note 27
Recommendations:

18) Give legislative implementation to all the proposals for reform that emerged from the General States of criminal execution (2015-2016).

19) Recognize institutionally and administratively the existing good practices of educating communities with prisoners carried out by the third sector (civil society).

4. MIGRANTS

FOCUS ON: Recommendations n° 145.159 up to 145.182

APG23 has launched 8 shelters for adult refugees and 2 for MSNA. It participates in the SPRAR national reception system in various territories, collaborating with Prefectures and Police Headquarters. From 2011 to 2018, 1247 asylum seekers were welcomed into our homes and structures, and were accompanied on their journey towards integration and autonomy. Since February 2016, in collaboration with the Community of Sant’ Egidio and with the Federation of Evangelical Churches in Italy, APG23 participates in the humanitarian corridor, that has so far enabled hundreds of people to arrive safely and legally in Italy; in November 2018, in collaboration with UNHCR Niger/Libya, APG23 welcomed vulnerable migrants evacuated from Libya. In the last year, we have witnessed an increase of xenophobia, intolerance, and hate speech as well as serious problems for sea rescue and a worsening regulation for migrants.

Recommendations:

20) Strengthening the creation of the above mentioned "Humanitarian corridors" that allow secure and regular access to the national territory, as a stable instrument in our legal system.

21) Subscribe the Global Compact on a Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration.

22) Adopt active policies for the integration of foreign citizens by issuing a residence permit for "proven integration", a temporary residence permit for job search and reintroducing the sponsor system (direct call system), also by private individuals for the insertion in the labour market of the foreign citizen.

23) Restore the regular entry channel for work in Italy, pursuant to art. 22 D.lgs. 286/98 but, in fact, blocked for the lack of emanation, for many years, of an adequate flow decree.

24) Strengthen policies to combat racism and xenophobia and implement new ones against the criminalization of solidarity by establishing a national database of hate crime or crimes committed with the aggravating circumstance of racial discrimination.

25) Provide assistance to people saved in the Mediterranean Sea in unity with other European States.

26) Review, by listening to the social partners, the L. 1 December 2018, n. 132.
APG23 supports the so called “Nordic Model”, a political and cultural approach that claims to defend gender equality rejecting the idea that women and children, mostly girls, are commodities that can be bought, sold and sexually exploited by men. Addressing the root causes of human trafficking means to stop the demand, punishing the clients that support trafficking and sexual exploitation buying sex on the streets.56 57 58

Recommendations:
27) Implement the recommendations of the European Parliament Resolution of 26th February 2014 on sexual exploitation and prostitution, and on their consequences for gender equality (2013/2103 (INI))59, adopting the so called “Nordic model”.
28) Incentivize the labour insertion of victims with appropriate regulatory instruments.

6. MINORITIES - ROMA
FOCUS ON: Recommendations n° 145.144 up to n° 145.156
APG23 lends its work to the RSC population in Italy for about twenty years.60 It also has a "Good Neighbour" Project under way that provides for the reception of family units near its facilities, using campers or caravans as dwellings. Making its own and recalling the content and concerns expressed in the European Parliament Resolution of 13 November 2018 on minimum standards for minorities in the EU (2018/2036 (INI))61 and in the Resolution of the European Parliament of 25 October 2017 on issues related to fundamental rights in the integration of the Roma in the European Union: the fight against the anti-Gypsyism (2017/2038 (INI))62, APG23 wishes to denounce the eviction of nomad camps implemented in ways that are seriously detrimental to the respect of fundamental human rights.63

Recommendations:
28) Define a clear, direct anti-discrimination policy, providing users with simple tools to be used in case of need (telephone numbers, local references, etc) with attention to work.
29) Approve specific rules for the recognition and protection of the Roma and Sinti minorities present in Italy.
30) Implement the Framework Convention on National Minorities of the Council of Europe64, and the many recommendations of the OSCE65, of the Council of Europe and of the institutions of the European Union which set out objectives and instruments for the social inclusion of Roma and Sinti66 and of the Italian Constitution67.
31) Put an end to ” evictions” not respectful of human rights68 without simultaneous inclusion measures.

---

56 See www.questoeuromiocorpo.org
58 http://www.spaceintl.org/
60 Especially in Emilia-Romagna, Veneto and Piedmont, working in particular with families and young people through activities of: human promotion, after-school, legal assistance, support to parenting, discussion on legality, education to the proper access to social services and health-care-hosting of children, adults, households, within its facilities. Some volunteers of the Association, moreover, lived from 1993 to 2001 at the "temporary nomad camp" in via Portogallo in Rimini, recently disassembled.
64 https://rm.coe.int/168007edd0
65 OSCE Action Plan to improve the situation of Roma and Sinti in the OSCE area. Available at: https://www.osce.org/odihpr/175547/download=4
67 In the areas of aid to large families (art. 31 Cost. It.), access to credit for home ownership (art. 47 Cost. It.), access to even higher education (art. 34 Cost. It.), health services and welfare services, but also in the field of employment and vocational training (art. 35, 36 and 38 Cost. It.), promotion and enhancement of cultural expressions.
68 Right to housing, right to privacy, rights of the child, Art. 6, par. 1, ECHR (EU Convention on Human Rights) etc.